



**Minutes**  
**Carbondale Tree Board**  
**Regular Meeting**  
**Thursday, August 17, 2023**

Kari Bevevino called the meeting of the Carbondale Tree Board to order at 6:03 PM on Thursday, August 17, 2023, at the Carbondale Town Hall and Virtual.

**The following members were present for Roll Call:**

Members Present:

Dan Bullock	Member
Kari Bevevino	Member
Joanne Teeple	Member
Sky Quarto	Member

Members Absent:

Lisa Paige	Chair
------------	-------

Town Staff Present:

Marty Silverstein	Board of Trustees Liaison
Carl Meinecke	Town of Carbondale Staff Liaison
Kelley Ambdur	Town of Carbondale Planner
Kae McDonald	Boards and Commissions Clerk

Guests:

Gabriella Sutro	189 N. 7th Street
Julie Pratt	The Land Studio
Doug Pratt	The Land Studio
Samuel Martinez	530 Dakota Court
Lora Criswell	530 Dakota Court
Rose McDonald	530 Dakota Court

## 1. Roll Call

## 2. Approval of May 18, 2023 and July 20, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Move to approve the May 18, 2023, meeting minutes with two corrections on page three "...survive the utility tie-ins; she advocated for removing the large spruce..."

*Moved by:* Jo Anne Teeple

*Seconded by:* Dan Bullock

**Carried**

Moved to approve the July 20, 2023, meeting minutes with the addition of Melissa Schreiner and Chris Beiser to the guest list.

*Moved by:* Sky Quarto

*Seconded by:* Dan Bullock

**Carried**

## 3. Items from Citizens Present Not on the Agenda

Gabriella Sutro, 189 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street, explained that she has lived at this address for 25 years and over the last year limbs dropping from the two Siberian Elms located have caused significant damage to three cars – most recently during Mountain Fair -- and a play structure located in her yard. She pointed out that a smaller Canadian Maple had been planted under the larger elm and its growth is now being affected by the larger tree.

Dan commented that there was a significant downdraft during Mountain Fair that caused a lot of branches to fall around town, and this experience was not unique to her. He asked about the history on the spruce trees located within the right-of-way along Lincoln Avenue, noting that they are not on the approved Street Tree list. He pointed out that if the elms are removed, new street trees might be planted that would limit parking in the right-of-way.

Sky commented that that one of the reasons she wanted to be on the Tree Board because she doesn't like Siberian Elms but admitted that they are a large part of the shade canopy in town. She wondered if there were a compromise that could be made.

Joanne asked if it was one or both trees dropping branches.

Gabriella replied that both trees were dropping branches.

Marty asked if Gabriella had spoken with the Public Works Director or Town Arborist and when the trees were last trimmed.

Gabriella replied that one was recently trimmed because it was impacting the electrical lines and a limb was cleaned up after the October snowstorm.

Dan reiterated that Gabriella's experience wasn't an isolated case and there were numerous tree limbs downed after the October storm. He related that the arborist is in the middle between neighbors that don't want a tree removed and neighbors that do. He pointed out that any new trees planted will take a long time to achieve the same stature as the trees that are

there now. He also asked that the mailbox attached to the tree be relocated and reiterated that parking in the right-of-way shouldn't be a presumed right.

Joanne asked if the Canadian Maple was irrigated. She asked why there was red tape on the tree. She wondered how stable the Siberian Elm was, noting that while the Siberian Elm provided the Canadian Maple with shade, the tree is probably past its prime and should be removed to give the Canadian Maple a chance to thrive.

Gabriella replied that they water the Canadian Maple, and the red tape was placed there by the crew trimming trees for the electrical line.

Carl agreed with Dan about being in the middle of competing interests. He explained that tree risk is a difficult assessment, but it is one of the most important activities he does for the Town. He noted that the Siberian Elms in question have been assessed for risk and were given a moderate rating, adding that compared with the Siberian Elms along Sopris Avenue these two trees are in good shape. Carl thought that the trees could be pruned again and pointed out that the only other options are reduction pruning or removal. He noted that the cost to remove a large tree is about \$5,000.00 and that it is a big expense for the Town. He added that Siberian Elms are noted for their good structure and agreed that the tree crowding the Canadian Maple should be removed. Carl explained that he is doing his best to mitigate risk for everyone, pointing out that he had the tree crew look at the crown when they cleaned up the broken branch and they didn't see any additional weaknesses.

Sky asked if Carl maintained a waitlist of trees that should be removed.

Carl answered in the affirmative.

Sam Martinez, 530 Dakota Court, suggested a third option would be to utilize a cobra cable system to support the problem tree and help mitigate the risk of falling branches.

#### **4. American National Bank (ANB) Mixed-Use Project - Proposed Landscape Plan as part of a combined application for Major Site Plan Review, Conditional Use Permit and Rezoning**

Julie and Doug Pratt introduced themselves, and Julie explained that she passed around an updated landscape plan in response to some of Carl's comments. Julie noted those changes including:

- Corrected the landscape line to prevent it overlapping into the Colorado Department of Transportation right-of-way.
- Removed two trees that were blocking line-of-sight and removed a Burr Oak to connect the sidewalk.
- Julie explained that ANB Bank has a policy against planting Honey Locusts.
- Julie also explained that ANB Bank wants a uniform landscape as opposed to a "fruit salad" design and therefore she is advocating for the tree mix as designated on the landscape plan. Doug pointed out that all the trees selected were from Carbondale's approved Street Tree list.

Joanne asked if the landscape would be planted against the buildings, pointing out the fire risk associated with vegetation growing next to the building. She asked if there were any plans for planting a shade tree over the picnic tables. She also commented on the number of planned parking spaces.

Doug explained that the Unified Development Code requires a 10-foot landscape strip along Highway 133 and there is also a 10-foot setback requirement, which doesn't leave much leeway on where the landscape is located. He added that there will probably be something shading the picnic tables, but he wasn't sure what.

Kelley explained that the proposed ANB Bank project was utilizing two parking reduction allowances to achieve the 74 parking spaces down from over 90. She added that Staff recommends as few parking spaces as required in the UDC.

Marty asked if there were any electric vehicle charging locations included.

Doug replied that there will be four charging stations.

Dan commented that trees planted along Highway 133 have struggled for a variety of reasons. He suggested reviewing the tree counts on Colorado Tree View because it is the Tree Board's goal to maintain an average of 10% for each tree species in town. He asked whether they planned to add trees to the planting strip along Hendrick Drive.

Carl pointed out that he wanted to get the Tree Board's opinion on that strip, noting that it would locate the trees very close to the street and increase the potential to get damaged.

Julie explained that the strip is less than five feet wide.

Joanne commented about the planned use of seeded grass, noting that that area along Highway 133 is primarily weeds.

Carl replied that he has strong opinions, but that is CDOT's requirement.

Doug noted that there will be street improvements – including a pull-out onto Highway 133 – associated with the project and once those are complete, that would be the time to re-seed.

Joanne suggested moving the trees next to the parking lot to the planting strip along Highway 133 to protect them from high-profile vehicles.

Dan suggested adding two smaller-stature trees to the proposed plans to replace the two that were eliminated due to sight-line issues.

Joanne asked what they were proposing for mulch. She urged them to consider using bubblers instead of a drip system.

Julie replied that they were advocating for the use of ½ - inch crushed granite.

**Motion Passed:** Dan **moved** to approve the ANB Bank landscape plans with the addition of two or three more trees in the planting strip. Sky **seconded the motion**, and it was **unanimously approved**.

## 5. Member Reappointments: Dan Bullock, Joanne Teeple, Lisa Paige

**Motion Passed:** Dan **moved** to recommend Joanne Teeple to the Board of Trustees *as a full member of the Tree Board*. Sky **seconded the motion**, and it was **unanimously approved**.

**Motion Passed:** Sky **moved** to recommend Dan Bullock to the Board of Trustees *as a full member of the Tree Board*. Joanne **seconded the motion**, and it was **unanimously approved**.

**Motion Passed:** Dan **moved** to recommend Lisa Paige to the Board of Trustees *as a full member of the Tree Board*. Joanne **seconded the motion**, and it was **unanimously approved**.

## 6. Carl's Tree Report

Carl summarized recently completed contract work:

- 189 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street: Removed large branch stub from north Siberian Elm
- Weant Boulevard across from the Jail & Cabin History Park: Removed Cottonwood and ground stump
- Sopris Park: Cleaned up the crown and checked cables on a Cottonwood and Silver Poplar; crown clean and removed a large branch on Silver Poplar; Emergency pruning on Cottonwood after wind burst

Carl listed planned residential work that will go out to bid:

- 86 S. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street: Siberian Elm trimming and crown clean
- 210 Garfield Avenue: Remove Siberian Elm and grind stump
- 266 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Street: Siberian Elm crown clean
- Sopris Avenue: Remove one Box Elder; crown clean, raise over street and reduce from house four Siberian Elms
- 175 Oak Run: Remove one Cottonwood
- 189 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street: Crown clean, raise over street and reduce from house one Siberian Elm

Carl listed planned work in various Town parks that will go out to bid:

- Gianinetti Park: Remove one Cottonwood and crown clean one Willow
- Miners Park: Cable one Cottonwood
- Glassier Park: Crown clean one Siberian Elm and crown clean and raise over street one Siberian Elm
- Thompson House: Crown clean one Siberian Elm

Carl noted that this work will consume much of the remaining 2023 budget. He added that he is working on his 2024 budget request.

## **7. Emerald Ash Borer**

Carl referred to the preliminary EAB management report included in the meeting packet, noting that his primary tools will be to monitor and track any EAB spread through Geographic Information System. He added that he learned a lot from last month's meeting, and he plans to chemically treat high value ash trees with a 10" or larger circumference except for a concentration of smaller ash trees concentrated in the downtown area. He noted that the trees will be treated on a three-year rotation for at least 15 years. Carl pointed out that ash trees with a circumference smaller than six inches will most likely need to be removed but explained that some of that work will need to be spaced out because of budget concerns and workload. He added that replanting might not take place at every location where a tree is removed because some locations aren't good fits for new trees.

Dan asked if Carl knew the locations of the different sized ash trees. He asked if irrigation systems would be inspected prior to treatment and/or replanting.

Carl replied that he has been locating and assessing each ash tree and now knows where most of them are. He pointed out that he will require help from the Public Works Department to assess the irrigation and he will be augmenting his 2024 budget request to take care of the addition costs.

Joanne suggested including an inflation multiplier and to add verbiage to his budget request about unanticipated costs for new trees.

Dan pointed out that the costs for planting new trees could be augmented by Arbor Day and other grant sources.

Marty agreed with Joanne and suggested adding a placeholder in the budget for new trees. He asked how many ash trees are planted in the right-of-way at River Valley Ranch. He asked if RVR has been cooperative in addressing this threat.

Carl replied that there are 278 ash trees in the right-of-way. He explained that he has been talking with RVR's landscape manager, but they haven't yet worked out any details for treatment.

Dan pointed out that there are at least 400 more ash trees planted on private property in RVR. Carl noted that both the Parks and Recreation Commission Chair and the Environmental Board Chair had responded via email regarding the EAB treatment plan, and their comments encouraged the proper application of the insecticidal treatment and encouraged the development of a "Preferred Contractor" list.

Dan commented that he preferred the registration of tree contractors over a preferred contractor list. He added that he was aware of at least one Homeowners Association that has already sprayed an ash tree in the public right-of-way and stated that HOA's and private property owners need to be informed that they need to notify the Public Works Department before they treat any trees.

Marty thought it was important to consult with the Public Work's Director and the Town's attorney regarding those issues. He noted that the Chacos Park Master Plan is just getting underway and might be a good opportunity to incorporate concerns regarding the ash trees in that location.

Carl replied that he supports education in general to give private property owner's the ability to make their own decisions, and while the Town won't use aerosol chemicals to treat ash trees homeowners may decide that works best for them.

Kari related that in the Northeast, there was a concerted public information campaign regarding the lanternfly that included pictures and strategies.

Carl summarized the costs for treatment and removal delineated by Town parks, Town rights-of-way, and RVR.

Dan asked where the chipped material would be stored.

Carl replied that the Town doesn't have a good place to store material, so it will need to be chipped smaller than 1-inch and be taken to a designated landfill. He emphasized the need for public education regarding this strategy.

Joanne asked if it was possible to accelerate tree removal in the winter when the EAB was dormant.

Carl replied in the affirmative.

Dan encouraged the Tree Board members to support a new tree inventory since the last one was done in 2010.

Carl agreed but noted that he is considering asking the State Forestry for assistance.

Sam Martinez, 530 Dakota Court, noted that he was a certified arborist and was willing to quote prices for work related to the EAB. He also encouraged removing trees in the winter and volunteered his time to help Carl with assessments.

Marty replied that any work would be advertised via a Request for Proposal and most awards go to the lowest price that meets the industry standard.

## **Other Business**

Dan suggested cancelling the September meeting in lieu of a combined meeting with the Board of Trustees regarding the EAB Management Plan.

Dan presented a letter written on behalf of the Tree Board, Environmental Board, and the Bee Friendly Coalition with regards to saving the trees on the USFS property and asked for the Tree Board's approval.

Joanne commented that she does not agree with the premise of the letter and that the spruce trees in question are in bad condition and likely won't survive construction impacts in the long term.

Marty commented that the plans reflect requests that the Town made. He reminded the board members that the Forest Service is federal property and does not have to abide by Town requirements.

## **8. Adjournment**

The August 17, 2023, meeting of the Tree Board adjourned at 7:58 pm. The next regularly scheduled meeting is scheduled for September 21, 2023, at 6:00 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Kae McDonald

Boards & Commissions Clerk, Town of Carbondale