

The Council of the City of North Royalton caucused in the North Royalton City Hall Council Chambers, 14600 State Road on **December 6, 2022 at 7:00 p.m.**

PRESENT: Council: President of Council Paul Marnecheck, Council Representatives John Nickell, Linda Barath, Joanne Krejci, Jeremy Dietrich, Dawn Carbone-McDonald, Mike Wos, Legislative Services Director Dana Schroeder; **Administration:** Mayor Antoskiewicz, Law Director Thomas Kelly, Finance Director Jenny Esarey, Police Chief Keith Tarase

Agenda reviewed.

Ms. Schroeder stated that Ordinance 22-182 will be placed on third reading.

Mr. Marnecheck stated that Girl Scout Troop 77136 is here this evening to lead us in the Pledge of Allegiance.

The Council of the City of North Royalton met in the North Royalton City Hall Council Chambers, 14600 State Road on **December 6, 2022 in regular session.** The meeting was called to order at **7:02 p.m.** by President of Council Paul Marnecheck and opened with the Pledge of Allegiance.

PRESENT: Council: President of Council Paul Marnecheck, Council Representatives John Nickell, Linda Barath, Joanne Krejci, Jeremy Dietrich, Dawn Carbone-McDonald, Mike Wos, Legislative Services Director Dana Schroeder; **Administration:** Mayor Antoskiewicz, Law Director Thomas Kelly, Finance Director Jenny Esarey, Police Chief Keith Tarase

CONSENT AGENDA

- a. Approval of Minutes: November 15, 2022
- b. Legislation:

RESOLUTION 22-182

Introduced by: Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos, Mayor Antoskiewicz. **A RESOLUTION COMMENDING SCOTT ALLEN SOPATA II ON THE ATTAINMENT OF THE RANK OF EAGLE SCOUT.** Title read.

RESOLUTION 22-183

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **A RESOLUTION CONFIRMING THE MAYOR'S REAPPOINTMENT OF JEFF HASTINGS AS A MEMBER OF THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON'S CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

RESOLUTION 22-184

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **A RESOLUTION CONFIRMING THE MAYOR'S REAPPOINTMENT OF MARK VITTARDI AS A MEMBER OF THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

RESOLUTION 22-185

Introduced by: Nickell, Carbone-McDonald, Krejci. **A RESOLUTION APPROVING THE APPLICATION OF CMW TRUST/STERLING MARTY TRUSTEE FOR PLACEMENT OF FARMLAND IN AN AGRICULTURAL DISTRICT, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

RESOLUTION 22-186

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE SUBMISSION OF AN APPLICATION ON BEHALF OF THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON FOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT SUPPLEMENTAL GRANT PROGRAM IN THE AMOUNT OF \$50,000 FOR FISCAL YEAR 2023, ACCEPTING SAID GRANT IF AWARDED, REQUESTING THE CUYAHOGA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT PERMISSION TO PARTICIPATE IN A COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

- No one on Council wished to have an item removed from the Consent Agenda for discussion.
- No one in the audience wished to have a legislative item removed from the Consent Agenda for discussion.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee for those legislative items on the Consent Agenda.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Carbone-McDonald to **adopt the Consent Agenda as presented and read.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

COMMUNICATIONS: Ms. Schroeder read 2 communications (Debi Beal, 7161 Albion Road and Marie Wallace, 9946 Bentley Drive) regarding Ordinance 22-190
See attached

MAYOR'S REPORT: No report.

DEPARTMENT HEAD REPORTS: No report.

PRESIDENT OF COUNCIL'S REPORT: Mr. Marnecheck stated that Mr. Wally Ohler, the city's Veterans Liaison Coordinator is here to speak tonight.

Mr. Ohler, 13075 State Road, stated he is here tonight to let each and every one of you know that sits on this Council, especially starting with the Mayor; how they have touched his heart and his family's hearts with your acts of kindness just recently with the plaque at the bridge. He has heard from many Veterans over this and residents of North Royalton, thanking him for what he does. Mr. Ohler stated what he feels is what all of us are about; we are God's children. Whatever it is that we can do to help someone that's struggling, we try and lift them up with food or a utility bill or transportation or care packages for their loved ones. Can you imagine, we have touched every country just about in the world with love and kindness for our troops deployed. Each and every one of you get special blessings because he sends them, they give them to me and he lets everyone know from every command throughout this country from the Marines at Guanaco to the 29 Palms in California to Fort Knox; they recently invited him there where he trained many years ago. It is an honor and privilege to be able to represent each and every one of you. Mr. Ohler stated to the Mayor and all of Council that every resident in this city are so touched and moved by your love and kindness; he sees it day in and day out and he lets the families of these soldiers know that it's not him, it's so many. What they have done has helped him to send so much. He has individuals that go out into the community and tell managers of stores what they have purchased is going into the box for our soldiers. There are a lot of good things that are happening and he is so blessed to be able to live in this city. Mr. Ohler would like to let each and every one of you know that every seed that he plants will help and never be forgotten. It will be sent to wherever that family is, he doesn't care. He stated you can't imagine where places are that we have sent things or he'll talk to families, about Vietnam; ones that served. He stated Mr. Dietrich started with the banners, and Mr. Ohler has tried, but all of his suggestions have implemented them and finished. Every family member that the banner is hanging that represents their loved one is so moved by that. This afternoon, one resident came up to my house and had an album of the event last week for Veteran's Day and ceremony for the plaque. They have pictures of every event from every one of you and told me they made this up for us because we cared about their loved ones and honored them that have left this earth. It is so special what you have done, you can't imagine the good and the kindness. He will plant that with every military individual family that he comes in contact with and let them know that this city is truly blessed with God's children. He can't thank the Mayor and Council enough, how they have lifted his heart up with so much sunshine for what they did. He never thought that coming back from Vietnam, the way all were treated in California by our own; the hatred, how the Mayor and Council have removed some of that from his heart from what they have done.

Additionally, Mr. Marnecheck stated North Royalton City Council is doing another Holiday Lighting contest. The ward winners will be announced on December 21, 2022. One will be named Best in North Royalton on December 23rd. The deadline to enter is December 16th. Hopefully, many individuals do enter and Council's plan is to release a list of all of the homes that have entered so that we can all travel around this beautiful town and see decorated houses. His goal is to have the trophies to wet your appetite before the next meeting.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

All Boards and Commissions announced the dates and times of their next regularly scheduled meetings. All meetings are held at City Hall, 14600 State Road, unless otherwise noted. A complete meeting schedule is available from the Council Office. **Any changes to the regular schedule of Council or committee meetings are noted below.**

Mr. Marnecheck stated there will be a Special Finance Committee meeting scheduled for December 20, 2022 at 6:30 p.m.

PUBLIC DISCUSSION

Stephen Kolozvary
6233 Bunker Road
RE: Ordinance 22-190

Mr. Kolozvary stated he read what was written in the newspaper about the facts that were presented at a meeting that we didn't know was going to take place. The way things are sold to us, especially about surveillance cameras is they are going to make us safer. First of all, he doesn't think that North Royalton has a crime wave currently. The cameras do not make us safer. What they do is photograph; in this instance they get an impression of the license plate, doesn't prevent crime, won't prevent crime, but it may help in solving crimes. That has to be the way it is represented and it's not. We are being told buy these devices, we don't know how much they are going to be; we do know that the data they collect does not belong to the City of North Royalton, does not belong to the citizens. It is going to belong to a vendor and that vendor will change. Getting access to it is not going to be easy for us (residents), but perhaps the Police will have access to it. Bottom line is that there is no one monitoring these cameras. We get the impression by watching tv that there is someone 24/7 in front of that view screen and saying "Oh my God, that's the car"; it doesn't happen that way, might be months and months before you ever connect that to a crime or another criminal incident.

Mr. Marnecheck stated just as a procedural reminder, Public Discussion is not a back-and-forth discussion. You come to address, so if we do not respond that's why.

Barbara Porzio
6233 Bunker Road
RE: Ordinance 22-190

Ms. Porzio stated that was her husband that just spoke and they are both passionate about the idea of protecting our fundamental rights of privacy. Her husband's point about the system not being affective in preventing crime is one that has been born out by research; there is very little evidence that prevents any crime, to the extent that is the reason for the cameras it is a false narrative that these cameras will help in preventing crime. The idea that these cameras might be a benefit; any system that is touched by people is subject to abuse; there is a lot of information available how different police and law enforcement officers have abused the system by using it to gather information that they should not be gathering. A question she has is, to the extent that there is going to be a camera system in place, she would like to know what rules are going to exist; who is going to have access to the information, can we see if the information has ever been misused. If we have a police officer who's misusing the information, will we be able to know that; is there a way to monitor whether the system is being used for a proper purpose or for an improper purpose. That was not explained in the article. The article does say this: the Police Chief who's noted by name, they originally wanted 26 cameras, but reduced it to 15. He said with the size of North Royalton, that going to a smaller number would not be effective. Ms. Porzio stated, our own Chief of Police said this smaller number of cameras would not be effective. So why are we doing this, why are we spending the money? She stated she spoke to several of their neighbors, there wasn't one who said it was a good idea. People said things like: it was a waste of money, it doesn't help, we don't want to incentivize people to violate other peoples' rights by taking pictures of them. Her cynical view of this, she worries that the cameras will be used eventually for things like speeding tickets; though everyone has been reassured. Ms. Porzio asked if that was part of the contract. She asked if she can read the contract that is being proposed.

Ms. Schroeder stated it is online right now.

Ms. Porzio stated when this Council sat here and took information about the effectiveness of this system, did you only hear one side of the story? Did you only hear from the vendor? Did you hear from anybody like a lawyer from the ACLU; someone that is concerned about privacy rights? If you only hear from one side of the story, you can't really make an informed decision. She stated she was a judicial officer for 30 years and what we were always told that you hear both sides of the story before you make an informed decision and to the extent, the person who wants to sell you something for \$40k or \$25k, to the extent that person is giving you information and maybe biased because they want to make a sale. The Chief of Police saying it will not be effective and all of her neighbors have expressed reservations about whether this is even a good idea. The bottom line is you have to do a balancing act; you have to consider what is the good to the community compared to the detriment to the people that live in this community. You have to do that balancing act and asks that Council takes into consideration that privacy is an important right. We have said that over and over again in the cases based on Constitutional Rights. We don't want to have intrusive police presence. There is not a crime problem in North Royalton. We are solving a problem that doesn't exist? It is not effective.

LEGISLATION**SECOND READING CONSIDERATION****ORDINANCE 22-181**

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **AN ORDINANCE TO MAKE APPROPRIATIONS FOR CURRENT EXPENSES AND OTHER EXPENDITURES OF THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON, STATE OF OHIO, DURING THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2023.** Title read.

Placed on **third reading**

FIRST READING CONSIDERATION**ORDINANCE 22-187**

Introduced by: Krejci, Barath, Marnecheck. **AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING A ONE YEAR EXTENSION OF THE JOINT MUNICIPAL IMPROVEMENT CONSORTIUM'S CONTRACT WITH PORTS PETROLEUM FOR THE PURCHASE OF FUEL FOR THE 2023 SEASON, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **adopt Ordinance 22-187.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

ORDINANCE 22-188

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE ORIGINAL APPROPRIATION ORDINANCE 21-184 AS AMENDED BY ORDINANCES 22-21, 22-34, 22-53, 22-74, 22-88, 22-97, 22-119, 22-145, 22-173 AND 22-180 FOR THE FISCAL YEAR ENDING DECEMBER 31, 2022 BY TRANSFERRING APPROPRIATIONS AND MAKING ADDITIONAL APPROPRIATIONS, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **adopt Ordinance 22-188.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

ORDINANCE 22-189

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN EIGHTH AMENDMENT TO THE AGREEMENT FOR PUBLIC SAFETY DISPATCH SERVICES BETWEEN THE CITY OF STRONGSVILLE, OHIO AND THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON, OHIO TO AMEND THE PROVISION RELATING TO PAYMENT FOR DISPATCH SERVICES, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Carbone-McDonald to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Mr. Wos to **adopt Ordinance 22-189.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

ORDINANCE 22-190

Introduced by: Wos, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald. **AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH FLOCK SAFETY FOR FLOCK FALCON CAMERAS, INSTALLATION AND PROFESSIONAL SERVICES FOR THE NORTH ROYALTON POLICE DEPARTMENT FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$28,500.00, WITH AN ANNUAL PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COST OF \$25,000.00, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Mr. Dietrich to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Four** (Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich). Nays: **Three** (Marnecheck, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). **Motion defeated.**

Placed on **second reading**

ORDINANCE 22-191

Introduced by: Vos, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald. **AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH SENIOR TRANSPORTATION CONNECTION, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Krejci to **adopt Ordinance 22-191.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

ORDINANCE 22-192

Introduced by: Mayor Antoskiewicz. **AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR AND FINANCE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH VERIZON WIRELESS FOR CELLULAR SERVICE, INCLUDING MONTHLY ACCESS FEES, AND EQUIPMENT CHARGES FOR ONE HUNDRED (100) ESTIMATED LINES FOR YEARS 2023 AND 2024 FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$80,000.00, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Carbone-McDonald to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Mr. Vos to **adopt Ordinance 22-192.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

ORDINANCE 22-193

Introduced by: Nickell, Carbone-McDonald, Barath. **AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON PART 14 BUILDING AND HOUSING CODE, TITLE SIX MISCELLANEOUS BUILDING REGULATIONS BY CREATING A NEW CHAPTER 1477 ENTITLED REGULATIONS FOR THE USE AND INSTALLATION OF SOLAR ENERGY SYSTEMS, AND DECLARING AN EMERGENCY.** Title read.

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **suspend the rules requiring three readings and referral to committee.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.** Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Carbone-McDonald to **adopt Ordinance 22-193.** Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Vos). Nays: **None. Motion carried.**

MISCELLANEOUS

Mr. Dietrich stated he would like to speak on Ordinance 22-190. In a way, respond to some of the questions/concerns that some residents that have now left and for the rest of the audience that is here and for Council and anyone who votes. Mr. Dietrich stated he has pled his case on this and he has talked about how we are short-handed. He stated he wrote down specific things that these people/residents that came up and had concerns on.

They stated it won't prevent crime; it may help solve crimes. If we paid attention to this at all and how this system works, and no we weren't sold a bag of goods from the sales person. We also listened to (and he would've loved to responded while the residents were here) another city, another municipality that said this works to help prevent crimes and solve crimes. Very clearly. They (the residents) made a comment that it takes pictures of people or they said that was another resident that had multiple concerns from other residents; that it takes of pictures people. It does not take pictures of people; it takes pictures of license plates; that's all this is. This isn't a ticket issuing thing. They said that another resident had a concern that maybe in the future we would alter what it is and can they read the contract. That is what the contract would state. It's to take pictures of license plates. How would it prevent a crime? Well, it would prevent a crime because if that person who's under warrant or has just fled the scene of crime, they have that plate. It would scan and it would notify our Police Department, period. That's how it prevents crimes from happening here in the city. It would also help solve crimes, not may, it will help solve crimes. He feels passionate about this and it's our job to make sure that are Safety Department has the tools that they need to the job. This Police Chief wasn't pulled from a name out of a hat. This Police Chief feels very strongly that they need this at their department to help do their job better and Mr. Dietrich feels Council and as a city we owe it to our Chief to supply them with the tools that they need to do their job, especially the fact that they are almost at half staffed; we should have in this city with a size of almost 30k people and land mass that we have, we should have over 50 officers. An officer will cost over \$100k a piece when you add in all the benefits. This is a drop in the bucket as far as financial and the money is there and the Chief is actually taking it out of his budget.

They made a comment that was posted in the paper; 26 cameras and we are going to do 15 cameras and the Chief made a comment in the paper; however, it was written, that it would not be effective. The Chief did want 26, it didn't pass. His answer to that is you have to start somewhere. Some is better than none. He (Chief) is settling, because he has to compromise and Mr. Dietrich feels it is a good compromise. But what the Chief is saying, or what he understands it as, we still need to eventually get more to make it as effective as it needs to be. You have to start somewhere. Mr. Dietrich additionally commented on the statement "not a crime problem in North Royalton". He stated his grandmother used to feed him with all kinds of medicine and he said to her "I'm never sick and why do you keep giving me all this medicine?" She said "why do you think you are not sick?" Mr. Dietrich stated "ok" and he believes it's preventative. It has always been his goal in anything he does in life to be proactive when it comes to making sure things don't happen and never ever be in a situation where we need to be reactive. We have a situation in this city with cameras; we now have cameras. He stated he doesn't want to wait for a situation where these Flock Systems may have helped solve crimes and prevent crimes. And yes, there are murders in this city, yes, there are crimes that you don't always know of; no one sits there and reads the Police Blogger; there is theft in this city, we had one of the biggest drug busts in the city recently. We had an officer attacked, and he was part of that. This officer could have lost her life and we had the license plate number. Imagine if we had the Flock System. Imagine if we knew exactly where that guy was headed. We were searching for this guy, she happened to arrive at the scene. If that Flock System was here in this city, and we were like "here he is, he's on Wallings, he's trying to turn around". She potentially wouldn't have been alone.

It is a system that will help the officers do their job. So, whoever is in the audience and whoever votes on this, he understands that it's most likely going to go to 3rd reading, but please take into consideration what he said. Even if you added up all of your residents that complained about this, including we had the 2 that were here and everybody they had this on their list. Even if you add them all up, and you came up with 50 people, there are 30k + residents in this city and it's the Police Chief's job to make sure that they are all safe.

Mr. Nickell stated residents are encouraged to speak, but we need to speak with facts. The fact to say that there is no crime in the city is not accurate. Mr. Nickell asked the Chief of how many break ins or domestic violence cases do we have off hand each month. Chief Tarase stated at least over 20. Mr. Nickell asked the Chief if the Department ever gets a call of a wife being beaten by a husband or a boyfriend. Chief Tarase stated yes. Mr. Nickell stated, for example and for factual, say a boyfriend beats up a girlfriend or a wife. He gets in his car, car has a license plate, he leaves the city. The next day he comes back in the city and say he has a warrant for his arrest because he beat this woman up pretty bad. There is not a person watching this thing, it's an artificial intelligence. It is going to warn the police officer that this car that has a problem is in the city and is heading down York Road. Hopefully that car will be intercepted before that guy could maybe doing something bad again. Some people will go "Ohhh, poo poo, you are going to the worst extreme". We have crime and we have had murders and people getting beat up and drunk driving.

Mr. Nickell stated it can prevent crime. It can also help with crimes that are going on. Someone may do a crime now and then they are going to come back and do it again because they got away with it. If we have some kind of evidence that it may be a white Caravan at 2 a.m. went through the intersection and the police can trace it, they will have at least something to go on that there was a car in the city and did some damage, broke into your house. So not only when your house or car gets broken into, not only do you have property damage, it also can damage your psyche. Especially, if you are elderly. Now you are scared to death because you are in a house that someone had broken into. The system can help prevent it.

All the facts she (Ms. Porzio) said about the contract; how do we know what the contract is? We have been talking about the cameras for a long time. It's been in the paper and it's on the agenda. They are all public documents, they were here, you can request them, they can be emailed and in an instant, you can read the exact contract the way it is. There's nothing to hide, the data is proprietary, it's in there and in 30 days it drops off because you typically don't need the data after 30 days. Mr. Nickell stated he works in a school. They have a camera system, recording is constant. No one is sitting there watching it. Then, if there is a problem "Johnny" hits "Susie" or "Susie" might have hit "Johnny"; it's an equal world today. They can then look at the cameras. The camera will show what happened and who did what. It didn't prevent it from happening but they would have seen the truth and come up with any discipline they needed to.

As far as invading your privacy, we don't want to invade privacy, but in today's world, Google knows you are all here. You have a phone and Google knows you're all here, they know what you have looked on your history and a lot of people are on Tik Tok. Not only does Tik Tok know what you do and like and track; maybe so do some conspiracy foreign governments might be tracking everything we do and knows what we are doing. When you say "I don't want any of these things taking my picture because it's invading my privacy", then don't do a crime. Mr. Nickell stated if you don't do the crime, the camera won't be any use to the police because you'll have no crimes on your license plate.

The statement that “they will not be effective”. Mr. Nickell stated that’s not exactly what they say. You can have context. The reporter wrote the article, the Chief didn’t write it. The Chief asked for 26 cameras, they probably need a few more. Then the Chief said let’s start with 15. We are trying to compromise with other Council members at 10 cameras because some are concerned, as they should be, about the budget, but we have the budget.

It’s called a compromise; that’s how government hopefully could work. If our national government compromised more, we’d get more done. Mr. Nickell stated we have 3 members that have their concerns. He stated he has been on Council 13 years, he doesn’t know everything, but what he does know is if there is a problem in this city, this Chamber will be loaded. People will let us know they do not want it. We have 32-33k people; let’s say you have 50 people attend the meeting, the percentage is about .00001% of people that didn’t want it. As far he knows, this imperfect democracy does work on majority and that’s not a majority at all. It’s a super minority. If people really didn’t like it, they would be up here. A lot of times in politics if they don’t come up here, they are saying “Mr. Council/Ms. Council you are doing pretty good; do your thing because we don’t care, we are not here”. It can either be apathy or you’re doing a good job and they are not here.

Ms. Carbone-McDonald stated how do cameras take precedence over the safety of our officers on the ground. When she found out that our officers don’t have tasers, that became a huge red flag for her. When she asked, on the record, why don’t our officers have tasers, she was told that they are too expensive. Yet, we are coming here and we are putting all of this money into these cameras. The officer’s safety is her ultimate concern. The cameras are a great thing, eventually. 25 no, maybe 4 to start, yes. Until we get tasers and have our officers armed on the ground for their safety and for the safety of the residents, that’s a big red flag for her.

Ms. Carbone-McDonald stated she comes from a law enforcement family and she supports the Chief of Police. But, when she was asked about the tasers; she did her education, calling all surrounding cities and asked them. Everyone has tasers, all of the officers; we don’t. That’s a big, huge thing for her. She stated she comes from a law enforcement family; her dad was a police officer and her brother is also police officer and she would want him armed on the ground first before we have cameras. That is why she voted no tonight.

Mr. Marnecheck stated he sees a lot of students in the audience and we had a long-time member of Council, Don Willey. Anytime he would see anyone in the audience, he would make sure they knew what they saw tonight. He stated to the audience that they were all very fortunate, usually our meetings are quicker. He stated they saw a very passionate and very engaged meeting tonight. He stated he understands many of the audience members are here for school. He will be more than happy to go over what they saw tonight to make sure they have the information they need for their assignment. We have all been doing this for a little bit and on the outside, it might be a little difficult to unpack.

An audience member had a question in regards to the suspension of the rules requiring 3 readings and referral to committee and why 22-190 did not pass.

Mr. Marnecheck stated this is one of the benefits we have as we probably have the best Director of Legislative Services in all of Ohio, 88 counties. He stated what happened tonight is our Council Rules state usually something needs to have 3 readings and in order to waive that rule, 6 members of Council have to vote yes, that they want waive that rule, usually requiring this to be at 3 meetings to have it less than 3 meetings (1 or 2). Tonight, what happened was 3 members of Council said they want this to appear at a future meeting; no decision was made as to whether it is approved or not. It will be on our next meeting’s agenda.

Ms. Schroeder stated it will go through the same process next meeting.

Mr. Marnecheck stated he will be happy to meet with the audience members in Community Room A.

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by Mr. Marnecheck, seconded by Ms. Barath to **adjourn the December 6, 2022 City Council meeting**. Roll Call: Yeas: **Seven** (Marnecheck, Nickell, Barath, Krejci, Dietrich, Carbone-McDonald, Wos). Nays: **None**. **Motion carried**.

Meeting adjourned at 7:49 p.m.

APPROVED: /s/ Paul F. Marnecheck DATE APPROVED: December 20, 2022
PRESIDENT OF COUNCIL

ATTEST: /s/ Dana A. Schroeder
DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATIVE SERVICES

From: Debra Beal <debibeal@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Saturday, November 19, 2022 3:56 PM
To: Joanne Krejci <ward3@northroyalton.org>
Subject: Re: WARD 3 COUNCIL UPDATES

Good Afternoon:

I am happy to see that Council is considering the Flock camera systems. If you need more information, please let me know as I am the Clerk of Council in the City of Independence. These cameras have been in place in Independence for more than a year, and the successful apprehension of suspects is really very uplifting. Instead of doing pursuits, with the help of the cameras, the Police force can get the suspect's information, know where they live and arrest these individuals without incident. They have been very helpful in alot of the offenses happening on and near Rockside Road. I would urge you to plead with Council to consider getting these cameras. They are not an invasion of anyone's privacy, except maybe the criminal's.

If I can do anything to convince Council that these cameras are important to our city, please let me know.

Take Care and Happy Thanksgiving,

Debi Beal

TO THE MAYOR & CITY COUNCIL,

THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE TO THE
COMMUNITY. IN EFFORTS FOR YOU TO HEAR
THE VOICE OF THE COMMUNITY, OUR HOUSEHOLD
IS VERY AGAINST THE SURVEILLANCE CAMERAS,

PLEASE DO NOT INTRUDE OUR PRIVACY THROUGH
THESE CAMERAS NOR WASTE OUR TAX DOLLARS ON THEM
AND VOTE THIS DOWN FOR GOOD.

RECEIVED

THANKS,

NOV 30 2022

CONCERNED NORTH ROYALTON
RESIDENTS

MAYOR'S OFFICE
CITY OF NORTH ROYALTON

FRANK WALLACE
9946 BENTLEY DR.
N. ROYALTON, OH 44133

28 NOV 2022 PM 5 L



NORTH ROYALTON CITY HALL
ATTN: NB MAYOR + CITY COUNCIL
13834 RIOLE RO.
NORTH ROYALTON, OH 44133

